

## General

Recommendations for the depopulation of swine. AASV. September 2021. [https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation\\_recommendations.pdf](https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation_recommendations.pdf)

AVMA Guidelines for the Depopulation of Animals. AVMA. April 2019. <https://www.avma.org/sites/default/files/resources/AVMA-Guidelines-for-the-Depopulation-of-Animals.pdf>

Evaluating emergency euthanasia or depopulation of livestock and poultry. AVMA. April 28, 2020. <https://www.avma.org/sites/default/files/2020-04/Humane-Endings-flowchart-2020.pdf>

Arruda AG, Beyene TJ, Kieffer J, Lorbach JN, Moeller S, Bowman AS. A systematic literature review on depopulation methods for swine. *Animals*. 2020;10(11):2161. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani10112161>

\*AVMA Guidelines for the Euthanasia of Animals. AVMA. 2020. <https://www.avma.org/sites/default/files/2020-02/Guidelines-on-Euthanasia-2020.pdf>

\*AVMA Guidelines for the Humane Slaughter of Animals. AVMA. 2016. <https://www.avma.org/resources-tools/avma-policies/guidelines-humane-slaughter-animals>

\*National Pork Board. On-Farm Euthanasia of Swine. Pork Checkoff. October 17, 2016. <https://library.pork.org/share/5F48D9EB-EFC6-4C12-839FD55523AE8C40/?mediaId=85F3B807-880E-4D47-852EA5FD7C4F925B>

## Carbon dioxide

Meyer RE, Morrow WM, Stikeleather LF, Baird CL, Rice JM, Byrne H, Halbert BV, Styles DK. Evaluation of carbon dioxide administration for on-site mass depopulation of swine in response to animal health emergencies. *J Am Vet Med Assoc*. 2014; 244(8):924-933. <https://doi.org/10.2460/javma.244.8.924>

Pepin BJ, Williams T, Odland C, Spronk T, Nerem J. Modification of a standard dump trailer into a mobile carbon dioxide depopulation unit for swine. *J Swine Health Prod*. 2022;30:31-38. <https://doi.org/10.54846/jshap/1243>

Llonch P, Rodriguez P, Jospin M, Dalmau A, Manteca X, Velarde A. Assessment of unconsciousness in pigs during exposure to nitrogen and carbon dioxide mixtures. *Animal*. 2013;7:492-498. <https://doi.org/10.1017zS1751731112001966>

Meyer RE, Morrow WEM. Carbon dioxide for emergency on-farm euthanasia of swine. *J Swine Health Prod*. 2005;13(4):210-217. <https://aasv.org/shap/issues/v13n4/v13n4p210.html>

Meyer RE, Whitley JT, Morrow WEM, Stikeleather LF, Baird CL, Rice JM, Halbert BV, Styles DK, Whisnant CS. Effect of physical and inhaled euthanasia methods on hormonal measures of stress in pigs. *J Swine Health Prod*. 2013;21:261-269. <https://aasv.org/shap/issues/v21n5/v21n5p261.html>

Rice M, Baird C, Stikeleather L, Morrow M, Meyer R. Carbon dioxide system for on-farm euthanasia of pigs in small groups. *J Swine Health Prod*. 2014; 22(5):248-254. <https://www.aasv.org/shap/issues/v22n5/v22n5p248.html>

Stikeleather L, Morrow W, Meyer R, Baird C, Halbert B. Evaluation of CO<sub>2</sub> application requirements for on-farm mass depopulation of swine in a disease emergency. *Agriculture*. 2013;3:599-612. <https://doi.org/10.3390/agriculture3040599>

Bowman A. Use of modified rendering trailers to achieve rapid depopulation of modern sow units. National Pork Board Research Report #20-100. Published March 2021. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/research/use-of-modified-rendering-trailers-to-achieve-rapid-depopulation-of-modern-sow-units/>

Rotolo M. Field evaluation of humane pig euthanasia using a dump trailer as a CO<sub>2</sub> chamber. National Pork Board Research Report #20-119. Published November 2021. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/20-119-ROTOLO-final-rpt.pdf>

North Carolina Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services. Assembly Guide: mass swine depopulation system utilizing carbon dioxide. NCAGR. <http://www.ncagr.gov/oeep/documents/CO2VaporizerHowTov1.pdf>

National Pork Board. Planning for emergency depopulation and disposal. Pork Checkoff. April 26, 2020. <https://library.pork.org/share/5F48D9EB-EFC6-4C12-839FD55523AE8C40/?mediaId=F7549893-1D5E-42BD-879981850085984B>

\*Martoft L, Lomholt L, Kolthoff C, Rodriguez BE, Jensen EW, Jørgensen PF, Pedersen HD, Forslid A. Effects of CO<sub>2</sub> anaesthesia on central nervous system activity in swine. *Lab Anim*. 2002;36:115-126. <https://doi.org/10-1258/0023677021912398>

\*Forslid A. Transient neocortical, hippocampal, and amygdaloid EEG silence induced by one minute inhalation of high CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in swine. *Acta Physiol Scand*. 1987;130:1-10. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1748-1716.1987.tb08104.x>

\*Forslid A, Augustinsson O. Acidosis, hypoxia and stress hormone release in response to one-minute inhalation of 80% CO<sub>2</sub> in swine. *Acta Physiol Scand*. 1988;132:223-231. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1748-1716.1988.tb08321.x>

\* While not specific to depopulation, reference does provide relevant information

## Depopulation Literature

- \*Sadler LJ, Karriker LA, Schwartz KJ, Johnson AK, Widowski TM, Wang C, Sutherland MA, Millman ST. Are severely depressed suckling pigs resistant to gas euthanasia? *Anim Welf*. 2014;23:145-155. <https://doi.org/10.7120/09627286.23.2.145>
- \*Hagen C. Evaluation of rate of administration of various gas mixtures using the Smart Box euthanasia device as a humane and effective method of piglet euthanasia. National Pork Board Research Report #09-197. Published February 2012. <https://porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/09-197-HAGIN-VAST-revised.pdf>

### Carbon monoxide

- Carbon monoxide levels chart. GasLab. June 30, 2021. <https://gaslab.com/blogs/articles/carbon-monoxide-levels-chart>
- Hampson NB, Holm JR, Courtney TG. Garage carbon monoxide levels from sources commonly used in intentional poisoning. *Undersea Hyperb Med*. 2017;44(1):11-15. <https://doi.org/10.22462/1.2.2017.3>
- Ramirez B. Mass depopulation of swine facilities via onsite generation of carbon monoxide. National Pork Board Research Report #21-072. Published May 2022. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/21-072-RAMIREZ-final-rpt.pdf>
- Groth D. Quantifying a technique using carbon monoxide for the depopulation of swine. National Pork Board Research Report #21-073. Published May 2022. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/21-073-GROTH-final-rpt-REVISED.pdf>

### Gunshot

- Stahl CA. Determining the efficacy and safety of differing caliber/ammunition combinations for the humane euthanization and subsequent mass depopulation of market weight pigs. National Pork Board Research Report #20-115. Published November 2021. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/20-115-STAHN-final-rpt-revised.pdf>
- Stahl C, Fangman T. Understanding muzzle energy when selecting an appropriate firearm for humane euthanasia. *Pork Checkoff*. May 5, 2020. <https://library.pork.org/share/5F48D9EB-EFC6-4C12-839FD5523AE8C40/?mediaId=5D5F3841-799C-4D1D-A91E089912FF8BA7>
- Humane Slaughter Association. *Humane killing of livestock using firearms: guidance notes #3*. 2nd ed. Wheathampstead, England: Humane Slaughter Association, 2005. <https://www.hsa.org.uk/downloads/publications/hsa-humane-killing-of-livestock-using-firearms.pdf>

### Nonpenetrating captive bolt

- \*Widowski T. Effectiveness of a non-penetrating captive bolt for on-farm euthanasia of low viability piglets. National Pork Board Research Report #06-165. Published July 2008. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/06-165-WIDOWSKI-UofGuelph.pdf>
- \*Grist A, Lines JA, Knowles TG, Mason CW, Wotton SB. The use of a non-penetrating captive bolt for the euthanasia of neonate piglets. *Animals (Basel)* 2018;8:48. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani8040048>
- \*Casey-Trott TM, Millman ST, Turner PV, Nykamp SG, Lawlis PC, Widowski TM. Effectiveness of a nonpenetrating captive bolt for euthanasia of 3 kg to 9 kg pigs. *J Anim Sci*. 2014;92:5166-5174. <https://doi.org/10.2527/jas.2014-7980>

### Penetrating captive bolt

- Stahl C. Captive Bolt Considerations for Humanely Euthanizing Pigs. *Pork Checkoff*. May 8, 2020. <https://library.pork.org/share/5F48D9EB-EFC6-4C12-839FD5523AE8C40/?mediaId=A181CC16-87E9-443A-A93B0740B654E9BB>
- Kramer S, Wagner B, Robles I, Moeller S, Bowman A, Kieffer J, Arruda A, Cressman M, Pairis-Garcia M. Validating the effectiveness of alternative euthanasia techniques using penetrating captive bolt guns in mature swine (*Sus scrofa domestica*). *J Anim Sci*. 2021;99(3):skab052. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jas/skab052>
- Rademacher C, Skoland K, Brown J, Eggers J, Kaisand J, Karriker L. Evaluation of mass depopulation using a mobile v-restrainer unit with pneumatic captive bolt gun and electrocution. In: Proc 52nd AASV Annual Meeting. American Association of Swine Veterinarians; 2021:11-14. <https://www.aasv.org/library/swineinfo/item.php?25530>
- \*Humane Slaughter Association. Captive bolt stunning of livestock: guidance notes No. 2. 4th ed. Wheathampstead, England: Humane Slaughter Association, 2006. <https://www.hsa.org.uk/downloads/publications/captiveboltstunningdownload.pdf>
- \*Millman S, Woods J, Hill J, Schwartz K, Grandin T, Brooks Jr R, O'Connor A, Johnson A. On-farm validation of captive bolt technology as a single stage euthanasia method. National Pork Board Research Report #09-196. Published August 2012. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/09-196-MILLMAN-ISU-revised.pdf>

### Electrocution

- Kramer S, Wagner B, Moeller S, Bowman A, Kieffer J, Arruda A, Cressman M, Pairis-Garcia M. Technical Note Validation of the effectiveness of electric stunning for euthanasia of mature swine (*Sus scrofa domestica*). *J Anim Sci*. 2022 March. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jas/skac072>
- Mote B. Validation of a mobile electrocution system for humane mass depopulation of swine. National Pork Board Research Report #20-123. Published December 2020. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/20-123-MOTE-final-rpt.pdf>
- Johnson C. Application of electrocution in suckling pigs for mass depopulation. National Pork Board Research Report #20-117. Published July 2020. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/20-117-JOHNSON-final-rpt.pdf>
- Johnson C. Construction & Evaluation of Novel Electrocution Devices for Nursery Pigs & Breeding Stock. National Pork Board Research Report #21-071.

\* While not specific to depopulation, reference does provide relevant information

## Depopulation Literature

Rademacher C, Skoland K, Brown J, Eggers J, Kaisand J, Karriker L. Evaluation of mass depopulation using a mobile v-restraint unit with pneumatic captive bolt gun and electrocution. In: Proc 52nd AASV Annual Meeting. American Association of Swine Veterinarians; 2021:11-14. <https://www.aasv.org/library/swineinfo/item.php?25530>

\*Probst-Miller S. Determine and validate the optimal requirements and duration of time to achieve unconsciousness and euthanasia in pigs from birth to 15 pounds with a novel electrocution device. National Pork Board Research Report #10-077. Published September 2010. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/10-077-PROBST-MILLER-Carthage.pdf>

\*Blackmore DK, Newhook JC. Insensibility during slaughter of pigs in comparison to other domestic stock. *N Z Vet J* 1981;29:219-222. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00480169.1981.34850>

\*Humane Slaughter Association. Electrical stunning of red meat animals: guidance notes No. 4. Wheathampstead, England: Humane Slaughter Association, 2000;1-22. <https://www.hsa.org.uk/downloads/publications/electricalstunningdownload.pdf>

\*Anil MH, McKinsty JL. Variations in electrical stunning tong placements and relative consequences in slaughter pigs. *Vet J* 1998;155:85-90. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s1090-0233\(98\)80042-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/s1090-0233(98)80042-7)

\*Anil MH, McKinsty JL. The effectiveness of high frequency electrical stunning in pigs. *Meat Sci* 1992;31:481-491. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0309-1740\(92\)90030-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0309-1740(92)90030-8)

\*Lambooij B, Merkus GSM, VonVoorst N, Pieterse C. Effect of a low voltage with a high frequency electrical stunning on unconsciousness in slaughter pigs. *Fleischwirtschaft (Frankf)* 1996;76:1327-1328. <https://library.wur.nl/WebQuery/wurpubs/303415>

\*Denicourt M, Klopfenstein C, Dufour C, Pouliot F, D'Allaire S. Using an electrical approach to euthanize pigs on-farm: Fundamental principles to know. In: Proc 41st AASV Annual Meeting. American Association of Swine Veterinarians; 2010:451-468. <https://www.aasv.org/library/swineinfo/item.php?11244>

\*Denicourt M, Klopfenstein C, Dufour V, Pouliot F, Labrecque S, D'Allaire S. On-farm euthanasia: Efficient and safe (110 VAC) pig electrocution. In: Proc 40th AASV Annual Meeting. American Association of Swine Veterinarians; 2009:249-253. <https://www.aasv.org/library/swineinfo/item.php?9919>

## Manual blunt force trauma

Whiting TL, Steele GG, Wamnes S, Green C. Evaluation of methods of rapid mass killing of segregated early weaned piglets. *Can Vet J*. 2011;52:753-758. [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3119238/pdf/cvj\\_07\\_753.pdf](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3119238/pdf/cvj_07_753.pdf)

## Ventilation shutdown plus

Baysinger A, Senn M, Gebhardt J, Rademacher C, Pairis-Garcia M. A case study of ventilation shutdown with the addition of high temperature and humidity for depopulation of pigs. *Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association*. 2021; 259(4), 415-424. <https://doi.org/10.2460/javma.259.4.415>

Leonard SM, Ramirez BC, Brown JT, Weyer SE. Initial phases for conducting high temperature and high humidity depopulation research. In: Proc 52nd AASV Annual Meeting. American Association of Swine Veterinarians; 2021:9-10 <https://www.aasv.org/library/swineinfo/item.php?25529>

Leonard SM. Model of indoor environment and supplemental heat requirements for ventilation shutdown (VSD) in swine facilities. In: Evaluation of swine gestation-farrowing facility space and management for improving production welfare, and infectious disease containment. Dissertation. Iowa State University; 2020:124-150. <https://doi.org/10.31274/etd-20200624-159>

## Sodium nitrite

Pepin BJ, Odland C, Spronk T, Edler R, Williams T. Swine behavioral and physiological response to increasing sodium nitrite oral drench administration and resulting tissue residues. *J Swine Health Prod*. 2021;29:310-318. <https://aasv.org/shap/issues/v29n6/v29n6p310.html>

Lower A, Lee Y, Peterson B, Silva G, Connor J. Evaluation of sodium nitrite for mass euthanasia of commercial pigs. National Pork Board Research Report #20-118. Published November 2020. <https://www.porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/20-118-LOWER-final-rpt.pdf>

Shapiro L, Eason C, Bunt C, Hix S, Aylett P, MacMorran D. Efficacy of encapsulated sodium nitrite as a new tool for feral pig management. *J Pest Sci*. 2016;89:489-495. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10340-015-0706-7>

Institute of Medical and Veterinary Science. Assessing the humaneness and efficacy of a new feral pig bait in domestic pigs. Report for the Australian Government Department of the Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts. March 2010. <https://pestsmart.org.au/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2020/06/pigs-imvs-report.pdf>

US Department of Agriculture - Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service – Wildlife Services. Final environmental assessment: A small scale field evaluation of HOGGONE® 2 sodium nitrite toxicant bait for feral swine. July 2019. [https://www.aphis.usda.gov/wildlife\\_damage/nepa/states/AL/al-2019-sodium-nitrite-feral-swine-final-ea.pdf](https://www.aphis.usda.gov/wildlife_damage/nepa/states/AL/al-2019-sodium-nitrite-feral-swine-final-ea.pdf)

US Department of Agriculture - Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service – Wildlife Services. Decision and finding of no significant impact: Supplement to the Environmental Assessment: Field evaluation of HOGGONE® sodium nitrite toxicant bait for feral swine. May 2021. [https://www.aphis.usda.gov/wildlife\\_damage/nepa/states/TX/tx-al-2021-hoggone-supplement-fonsi.pdf](https://www.aphis.usda.gov/wildlife_damage/nepa/states/TX/tx-al-2021-hoggone-supplement-fonsi.pdf)

\* While not specific to depopulation, reference does provide relevant information

### Foam

Lindahl C, Sindhøj E, Brattlund Hellgren R, Berg C, Wallenbeck A. Responses of pigs to stunning with nitrogen filled high-expansion foam. *Animals*. 2020;10(12):2210. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani10122210>

Lorbach JN, Campler MR, Youngblood B, Farnell MB, Beyene TJ, Kieffer J, Moeller SJ, Arruda AG, Bowman AS. Comparison of gaseous and water-based medium-expansion foam depopulation methods in cull sows. *Animals*. 2021;11:3179. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani1113179>

Balzer K. *Stunning and killing non-viable piglets humanely with nitrogen enriched foam on farm level*. Dissertation. Fredrich Loeffler Institute; 2017.

Pöhlmann V. Study on the stunning of slaughter pigs with a nitrogen- filled, High-expansion foam focusing on the aspects of animal welfare and meat quality. Dissertation. Fredrich Loeffler Institute; 2018. <https://www.cabdirect.org/cabdirect/abstract/20183202722>

Marahrens M, Pöhlmann V, Balzer K, Stehle E, El Amarti A, von Frantzius I, Piotrowski D, Kiezebrink H, Schwarzlose I. Stunning of slaughter pigs and non-viable piglets with nitrogen gas filled high expansive foam – first results of a proof of concept. In: *Welfare Impacts of Controlled Atmosphere Methods for Stunning or Killing Animals*. APHA; 2017.

Wallenbeck A, Sindjöh E, Brattlund Hellgren R, Berg C, Lindahl C. Improved pig welfare at slaughter – pigs' responses to air or nitrogen foam. In: *Proc ISAE Nordic Region Winter Meeting*. International Society of Applied Ethology; 2020.

Sparrey J, Hill J. Nitrogen foam delivery system. In: *Proc 52<sup>nd</sup> AASV Annual Meeting*. American Association of Swine Veterinarians; 2021:5-8. <https://www.aasv.org/library/swineinfo/item.php?25528>

Williams T. Validation and demonstration of utilizing high expansion nitrogen foam for large scale depopulation of swine. National Pork Board Research Report #21-069. Published March 2022. <https://porkcheckoff.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/21-069-WILLIAMS-final-rpt.pdf>

Bowman A. Validating water-based foam for the depopulation of swine. National Pork Board Research Report #21-070.

### Human well-being

Strand EB. Animal depopulation resiliency check-in tool. AASV. November 2022. [https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation\\_debrief.pdf](https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation_debrief.pdf)

Strand EB. Herramienta de apoyo para la resiliencia humana en la despoblación de animales. AASV. Noviembre 2022. [https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation\\_debrief\\_es.pdf](https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation_debrief_es.pdf)

Strand EB. Animal depopulation resiliency check-in tool worksheet. AASV. November 2022. [https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation\\_debriefwksht.pdf](https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation_debriefwksht.pdf)

Strand EB. Ficha de herramienta de apoyo para la resiliencia humana en la despoblación de animales. AASV. Noviembre 2022. [https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation\\_debriefwksht\\_es.pdf](https://aasv.org/Resources/welfare/depopulation_debriefwksht_es.pdf)

The Center for Food Security and Public Health. Responder psychosocial impacts [Video]. Published December 2011. [https://www.cfsph.iastate.edu/Emergency-Response/Just-in-Time/02-Health-and-Safety\\_Responder-Psychosocial-Impact\\_PPT-VIDEO.mp4](https://www.cfsph.iastate.edu/Emergency-Response/Just-in-Time/02-Health-and-Safety_Responder-Psychosocial-Impact_PPT-VIDEO.mp4)

Dale A. Investigation into the psychological and physical effects of participating in a mass “depopulation” operation. Unitec Research Report. 2011. <https://www.researchbank.ac.nz/bitstream/handle/10652/1666/Final%20Report%20Dale.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>

Nusbaum KE. Novel roles for veterinarians in post-depopulation or disaster communities. APHA. 2006. [https://apha.confex.com/apha/134am/techprogram/paper\\_128855.htm](https://apha.confex.com/apha/134am/techprogram/paper_128855.htm)

Kadowaki H, Kayano T, Tobinaga T, Tsutsumi A, Watari M, Makita K. Analysis of factors associated with hesitation to restart farming after depopulation of animals due to 2010 foot-and-mouth disease epidemic in Japan. *J Vet Med Sci*. 2016;78(8):1251-1259. <https://doi.org/10.1292/jvms.15-0559>

Nusbaum K, Wenzel J, Everly G. Psychologic first aid and veterinarians in rural communities undergoing livestock depopulation. *J Am Vet Med Assoc*. 2007;231(5):692-693. <https://doi.org/10.2460/javma.231.5.692>

Vroegindewey G, Kertis K. Veterinary behavioural health issues associated with disaster response. *Aust J Emerg Manage*. 2021;36:78-84. <https://search.informit.org/doi/10.3316/agispt.20210729050857>

Baysinger A, Kogen L. Mental health impact of mass depopulation of swine on veterinarians during COVID-19 infrastructure breakdown. *Front Vet Sci*. 2022;9:842585. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fvets.2022.842585>

Bussolari C, Packman W, Currin-McCulloch J, Strand E, Kogan L. Mass depopulation of swine during COVID-19: An exploration of swine veterinarians' perspectives. *Vet Sci*. 2022;9(10):563. <https://doi.org/10.3390/vetsci9100563>

\*Edwards-Callaway LN, Cramer MC, Roman-Muniz IN, Stallones L, Thompson S, Ennis S, Marsh J, Simpson H, Kim E, Calaba E, Pairs-Garcia M. Preliminary exploration of swine veterinarian perspectives of on-farm euthanasia. *Animals*. 2020;10:1919. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani10101919>

\*Simpson H, Edwards-Callaway LN, Cramer MC, Roman-Muniz IV, Stallones L, Thompson S, Ennis S, Kim E, Pairs-Garcia M. Preliminary study exploring caretaker perspectives of euthanasia on swine operations. *Animals*. 2020;10:2269. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani10122296>

Rault J-L, Holyoake T, Coleman G. Stockperson attitudes toward pig euthanasia. *J Anim Sci*. 2017;95:949-957. <https://doi.org/10.2527/jas.2016.0922>

\* While not specific to depopulation, reference does provide relevant information